Project proposal to Nederlandse organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk onderzoek (NWO) for the programme “European Collaborative Research Project in the Social Sciences”

Human Smuggling and Trafficking in Migrants: Types, Origins and Dynamics in a Comparative and Interdisciplinary Perspective

Prof. Dr. Rinus Penninx
Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies, Amsterdam

Research partners in the programme “European Collaborative Research Project”:

Prof. Dr. Friedrich Heckmann, Dr. habil. Thomas Müller-Schneider
european forum for migration studies, University of Bamberg

Dr. Ferrugio Pastore
Centro Studi di Politica Internazionale, Rome

Jonas Widgren, Irene Stacher
International Centre for Migration Policy Development, Vienna

Prof. Dr. Rosa Aparicio Gómez
Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones, Madrid

Further research partner:

Prof. Dr. Sandro Cattacin
Swiss Forum for Migration Studies, Neuchâtel
Contents

1 Project background and theoretical framework ............................................. 3

2 State of the art in research, previous work and the applicants' research expertise relevant to the project
   2.1 Definitions and terminology .................................................................. 7
   2.2 State of the art in research, previous work and the applicants' research expertise in the partner countries ............ 8
      2.2.1 Germany ......................................................................................... 9
      2.2.2 The Netherlands .............................................................................. 11
      2.2.3 Italy .................................................................................................. 12
      2.2.4 Austria ............................................................................................. 14
      2.2.5 Switzerland ...................................................................................... 17
      2.2.6 Spain ............................................................................................... 18

3 Research goals and work plan
   3.1 Research goals ...................................................................................... 19
   3.2 Research design and applied methodology ........................................... 21
      3.2.1 Document analysis and expert interviews
      3.2.1.1 Data sources .................................................................................. 22
      3.2.1.2 Analysis of data collected by expert interviews and documents analysis: procedure and methodology .......... 25
      3.2.2 Qualitative, biographical in-depth interviews with smuggled persons: procedure and methodology .......... 26
   3.3 Work plan for the project partners: work packages and joint activities ............................................................................ 29

References
1 Project background and theoretical framework

Compared to first studies on migration phenomena and integration processes of migrants that were published in the United States in the 1930s and 1940s and in Europe in the 1960s and 1970s, migration studies and the development of migration theories have become widely differentiated. As transnational migrations processes are of great significance for nation states and societies, a wide range of research has been carried out in the last two decades, especially from interdisciplinary and transnational perspectives, resulting in an enhanced awareness of the complexity of this topic.

Whereas early studies focussed, for example, on certain migrant groups such as former guestworkers or refugees and their social situation in the receiving societies, irregular or illegal migration has been discovered as an important subject for research only fairly recently. Transnational movements that take place in defiance of national laws and regulations are not new though, but have seen an unprecedented increase in the last decades. Trying to explain the recent expansion and differentiation of these new phenomena, social and political scientists have started to explore the question how the origin of and increase in illegal migration into Western receiving countries can be explained, taking social, geographical aspects and legal regulations into consideration.

Researchers agree that illegal migration and human smuggling have recently become a mass phenomenon (Salt 2000b). One development is the increase in the desire to migrate in less developed countries. According to the Swiss migration researcher Hoffmann-Nowotny (1991; 1993) the international migration potential is then not only determined by the large differences in development between wealthy and poor countries, but also by what he calls the "global integration of values". He sees the world in a process of transition to a world society, to the one world which results from the diffusion of the Western cultural model. A common vision of humanity emerges which is characterised by wealth, welfare, social justice and individual rights to freedom. The "global integration of values" is the result of modern communication structures.

New aspirations may result as a consequence of the “global integration of values” which, in the face of the poor living conditions of people, may quickly be followed by feelings of frustration as to the possibilities to improve one's situation. A desire to migrate may be seen then as an attempt to improve one's situation abroad. Many people are today no longer willing to wait and see whether the situation in their own country will at some point in the future improve (Müller-Schneider 2000b; Heckmann et al 2000). In addition, it should be kept in mind that civil wars, armed conflicts and corruption violating traditional and fundamental rights are a major cause for migration. The desire to migrate is then the consequence of people wanting to live in peace and to be able to plan to improve their lives in another country.
Another important development which has created new conditions for world-wide migration is the **increase in opportunities for migration**. Included in these, on the one hand, is the **increase in resources**. Despite the widening gap between the incomes of poor and rich countries, incomes even in developing countries have still increased. According to calculations by the World Bank, this increase was approximately 190 percent in the decades between 1950 and 1990. Consequently, there are more and more people who, despite not living in prosperity, still have the means to migrate to other countries to find this wealth. Furthermore, new opportunities for mobility have emerged as a result of **revolutionary developments in transport**. Almost every country in the world can be reached from any other country within a relatively short space of time; in addition, flights are much cheaper and affordable for many more people. Migration has become less and less a problem of traffic and transport.

Due to the global integration of values and increased opportunities for mobility, a new population movement is in progress which only in part takes place through regular channels. This is due to the fact that the **world-wide desire to migrate exceeds the legal opportunities for migration** many times over. In addition to the "mismatch" mentioned above, a further condition must be given for the processes involved in human smuggling to take place at all. This condition is the existence of national migration barriers without which illegal migrants could simply cross borders between individual states without hindrance. In this case, smuggling would be completely unnecessary. It is only such measures which aim to prevent the illegal entry of migrants and which makes substantial assistance from third parties necessary in order to enter the country nevertheless. For this to happen, however, the barriers cannot be insurmountable; they rather have to reveal "weak points" which the smugglers can use for their purposes.

In Western states, such "weak points" do not result primarily from technical deficiencies, but because securing borders is subject to certain conditions. On the one hand, the borders must not be secured in a way which goes against humanitarian principles and, on the other, the requirements of increasing globalization must be respected. The need for assistance on the part of illegal migrants gives rise to new opportunities to earn money and the smugglers seize their chances. Their aim is to make profits; the fate of the migrants generally does not play a role for the human smugglers (Müller-Schneider 2000a, 2000b).

The development of smuggling organizations is not a sudden reaction to profit-making opportunities, but it is the result of an **inherently dynamic process**. This network process has its roots in the fact that smuggling into Western affluent societies has been a success for many migrants, that is, they did not just successfully enter the country, but they were able to a large extent to fulfil their aims in migrating. Through information passed back through the **transnational network of migrants**, people in the country of origin also heard of the success of these "pioneers" and so discovered a new opportunity to realise their own desires to migrate.
Once smuggling organizations have established themselves, then they try - in the same way as other organizations - to influence their surroundings to their advantage. That means in this case: smuggling organizations try to find ways and means to smuggle more and more migrants. The smugglers’ calculations are simple: the more migrants use their services, the higher the profits. To achieve their goals, smugglers may implement appropriate rationalisation measures, e.g. the recruitment of migrants. In countries of the former USSR, adverts can be found in public for the immediate supply of visas to Germany. In the Indian press, adverts by smugglers with the slogan "Go West" appeared. Another rationalisation method one could mention involves smugglers asking only for a deposit to be paid at the start of the journey. The remaining fees then have to be paid in kind upon arrival, often under degrading and inhumane conditions. In this way, organizations can also smuggle those migrants who otherwise would not be able to pay for their services. However, in order to implement this variation of smuggling which can be described as "migrate now, pay later", the organizations must be well connected to the illegal labour market in the receiving countries. The existence of a “shadow economy”, on the other hand, creates new incentives for illegal labour migration.

Human smuggling and illegal migration have also recently become major topics in the public discourse. Spectacular apprehensions of smugglers or dramatic pictures of unseaworthy boats crowded with refugees in the Mediterranean shape the image of smuggling operations: smuggling syndicates organize large operations involving big boats and many people. Experts from academia, governments, non-governmental or intergovernmental organizations concerned with human smuggling agree, however, that these events display only one aspect of a phenomenon which is much more complex (Heckmann et al 2000); it entails the following fundamental research problems:

**Smuggling as unintended consequence of restrictive admission policies**

Policy makers are faced with a humanitarian dilemma: an increasing proportion of asylum seekers is turning to smugglers to circumvent restrictive admission policies in developed countries. Asylum seekers cannot enter most European countries legally because they do not qualify for visas; so they use the services of smugglers to gain access. Smuggling has therefore become an unintended consequence of restrictive admission policies.

**Lack of controlling migration flows**

Until the second half of the 1980s human smuggling and trafficking were not perceived as a serious problem and were accordingly not discussed on a national and international level. This changed dramatically at the beginning of the 1990s when the phenomenon could no longer be ignored: governments started to tackle this problem of uncontrolled migration flows. But not only the government's perspective, but also the consequences for the smuggled migrants themselves were discussed. Sociological interviews with Iranian asylum seekers in the
Netherlands showed that 29 of the 32 interviewed persons entered the Netherlands with the assistance of smugglers in response to a series of obstacles, including visa restrictions and border controls. The respondents felt that they had lost control over the migration circle: decisions on routes, potential destination countries, travelling documents and transport were ceded to traffickers. Stranded in the Netherlands - only 3 of the respondents originally planned to go there-asylum seekers were isolated from supportive social networks. It was the smuggler who shaped migration patterns (Koser 1997, Böcker/Havinga 1998, Morrison 2000). A study about asylum destinations in Europe recently carried out by the Swiss Forum for Migration studies showed that all of the 174 asylum seekers interviewed in Switzerland had looked for the assistance of a smuggler or some kind of “supporter” at least at one point of their routes. However, smugglers happened to play very different roles in the migration process: In long distance routes by air, as described by most of the Sri Lankan refugees, the itinerary was usually organized before departure by family members (abroad or in Sri Lanka) and an “agency”, which planned each step of the route with different contact persons taking charge of the refugees. However, migrants from the Former Republic of Yugoslavia or Iraq travelling on the land route played a more active role in the negotiation with their agents and the choice of their routes (Efionayi-Mäder et al. 2001).

**Violations of human rights**

According to the International Organization for Migration at least 1,500 persons died since 1993 when attempting to enter the European Union illegally (IOM 2000). And many other dangers to the well-being of those who are smuggled can easily be identified (Doomernik 2000). In the process of resettlement, forms of “new slavery and “indentured service” develop as the illegal migrants are forced to work to pay back the fee for the smuggling operation.

Although the scientific community is more and more becoming aware of the complex nature of the phenomenon, systematic, transnationally coordinated research is still lacking: “The rhetoric has run ahead of the research and there is a fundamental lack of hard evidence relating to most aspects of the problem.” (Salt 2000a, 4). The planned project will make a contribution to fill this vacuum: it will link more differentiated and sophisticated approaches in migration theory, which have increasingly been developed recently, with systematic empirical social research, combining the collection of primary data and secondary data analysis. This will be done in comparative and interdisciplinary perspective.
2 State of the art in research, previous work and the applicants' research expertise relevant to the project

2.1 Definitions and terminology

Although the phenomenon has been debated intensively during the last decade, official sources, NGOs and researchers have not provided a globally agreed definition for the concepts of “smuggling” and “trafficking”: “The wide and increasing concern over trafficking migrants does not imply that a clear, simple and commonly accepted definition of such activities is readily available” (Gosh in Salt 2000b) which has been regarded as a serious hindrance to a fundamental understanding of the complexity of the problem. Indeed in the past the terms “trafficking” and “smuggling” have frequently been used more or less synonymous, making systematical analysis of existing theoretical approaches and empirical data more difficult.

However, most definitions contain points of agreement. Generally, human smuggling focusses on the illegal movements of migrants across international borders. However, cases might be included whereby entry into a country may be legal with the legal status of the migrant expiring in the country. This would, for instance, be the case when a tourist visa is used for the purpose of overstaying. A legal definition may therefore a more limited focus than a sociological one.

It is generally agreed that human trafficking is defined as smuggling plus coercion or exploitation, as when women agree to be taken unlawfully across borders to be hostesses or dancers but are forced into prostitution, or migrant workers must work in slave or indentured service conditions to repay smuggling fees (Martin/Miller 2000). A more general concept has been formulated by Salt and Stein (1997) who conceive trafficking as an “international business, involving the trading and systematic movement of people as “commodities” by various means and potentially involving a variety of agents, institutions and intermediaries.” (p. 470).

The United Nations has adopted two UN protocols supplementary to the Convention against Transnational Organized Crime on 15 November 2000 which were opened for signature at the conference in Palermo, Italy. The protocols included a widely acknowledged definition of

---

1 A detailed and comprehensive overview on definitions and concepts can be found in Salt 2000.

2 The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking Persons and The Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea.

3 The conference took place from 12 to 15 December and 124 of the UN's 189 member nations signed the convention. The provisions will enter into force after 40 governments have ratified them. It is the first legally binding UN instrument in the field of crime.
“human smuggling” and “trafficking” which will form the terminological basis of the planned project: Smuggling of migrants shall mean the intentional procurement for profit for illegal entry of a person into and/or illegal residence in a state of which the person is not a national or permanent resident. Trafficking in persons means the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, either by the threat or use of abduction, force, fraud, deception or coercion, or by the giving or receiving of unlawful payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having the control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation (United Nations General Assembly 2000).

Even though these recent UN definitions provide for a clear distinction between “smuggling” and “trafficking” of migrants in legal terms, the two phenomena might be linked; so any research in either phenomenon should not exclude the other. This is reflected in the perspectives of the project partners. Some derive their interest in the subject out of concern for the human rights of exploited migrants and thus enter the research arena with a focus on trafficking, others start their investigation from the perspective of the receiving state and immigration control.

2.2 State of the art in research, previous work and the applicants' research expertise in the partner countries

There is limited theoretical literature dealing with the complex phenomenon of human smuggling and trafficking in migrants. The literature available offers only two discourses, the economic and the criminal (Salt 2000b). Discussing trafficking as an economic activity Salt and Stein (1997) have produced a model of trafficking as a business representing trafficking networks as business organizations. Kyle and Liang (1998) suggest that trafficking should be viewed as a consequence of the commodification of migration, from which organizations are able to make profits of people's mobility. As an example they are referring to Ecuador and China: they argue that “embedded commodification” of clandestine migration occurs in which migration merchants play a central role. This occurs within groups bounded by racial-ethnic stratification and regional power structures.

A second discourse discusses trafficking as a criminal activity. Attention is being paid especially to the nature of the work in which trafficked migrants often find themselves, from the “re-feudalization” of the service sector to comparisons of modern trafficking with the historical concepts of slavery (Salt 2000b).

In the following sections we are now going to discuss the state of the art in research literature in the participating countries as well as their respective previous work and expertise relevant to the planned project.
2.2.1 Germany

Despite the attention cases of human smuggling and trafficking in migrants attract in the media and the press, this complex phenomenon has been very much neglected by systematic research. The available publications dealing with this topic are legal analyses (Renner 1999), policy analyses (Sieveking 1999) or qualitative empirical studies. The latter are mainly focussing on limited aspects, such as the social situation of illegal migrants in the receiving country, and are based on very small samples. Cyrus (1995), for example, conducted interviews with illegal Polish migrants in Berlin as well as with returned migrants in Poland, Alt (1999) interviewed 35 illegal migrants and numerous social workers in Leipzig. To generate hypotheses on the social situation of illegal migrants and to find out whether the German social security system is an incentive for illegal migration Vogel conducted 15 qualitative interviews with illegal Brazilian migrants in Berlin who overstayed after their tourist visa had expired. Whereas these qualitative studies shed some light on the living conditions of illegal migrants in German cities and provided valuable insights, they remained explorative and too narrowly focussed.

Regarding theory development, analysis of the state of the art in research literature and building up an expert network the european forum for migration studies at the University of Bamberg has previously carried out several projects relevant to the topics of human smuggling and trafficking in migrants.

In his recently concluded project at the european forum for migration studies Müller-Schneider analyzed the social organization of international migration and developed a theoretical approach which contributed to a further development of current migration theory (Müller-Schneider 2000a, 2000b). Besides other forms of migration the study was focussed on the origin of and increase in the smuggling of migrants into Western receiving countries which was examined on the basis of numerous interviews with experts from the Federal Office for the Recognition of Asylum Seekers, the German Federal Border Police, local police authorities and various NGOs. Due to the global integration of values, the increase in world-wide opportunities for mobility and the increase in resources, even in developing countries, a new global migration situation has developed. More and more people can and want to migrate, but cannot do this legally. This results in a demand for the services of smugglers without whom national migration barriers cannot be crossed in many cases. In this situation profit-orientated smugglers appear. In a inherently dynamic process, smuggling organizations are created or existing criminal organizations are restructured. The accessibility of eastern Europe has greatly accelerated the formation of such organizations. It is only due to the emergence of many, transnationally active organizations that large-scale smuggling of migrants can take place at all. In addition, smuggling organizations - again for profit motives - implement rationalisation measures which aim to increase the amount of migrants to be smuggled. So the formation of organizations and
rationalisation are central aspects in the explanation of human smuggling today.

The European Forum for Migration Studies was asked to compile an expert report on illegal employment of foreigners in Germany (Lederer/Nickel 1997) for the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung in Bonn in 1997. Germany’s complex immigration system with its large number of different migration types results in a wide variety of illegal migration forms. They, in turn, also entail a wide variety in the way of life of illegal migrants, with respect to their entry into illegality, the causes and motivation for their migration, the planned and actual duration of their stay, and their socio-economic situation. The literature on the subject differentiates between a large number of respective patterns and underlying causes, ranging from foreign students with expired residence certificates to prostitutes who have been smuggled into the country (Lederer/Nickel 1997, 18ff). The study provided an overview on forms and origin of illegal migration, on the social situation of illegal migrants in the receiving society, on forms of illegal employment, on obstacles for measuring the quantitative dimensions of illegal migration and on the economic consequences of illegal migration.

In cooperation with the Institute for the Study of International Migration at Georgetown University the European Forum for Migration Studies organized two transatlantic conferences on human smuggling and trafficking. The first one was held at the Akademie für Politische Bildung in Tutzing on March 8-9, 2000, the second one in Washington on June 4-5, 2000. The conferences brought together representatives from government, police, academia, professional associations, non-governmental and intergovernmental organizations concerned with human smuggling from Europe and North America in order to discuss their perspectives and to exchange their knowledge on human smuggling as a transnational problem. The main topics discussed were forms, routes and causes of human smuggling, trafficking for sexual exploitation, smuggling of asylum seekers, the links between human smuggling operations and document fraud, the consequences of human smuggling for the social situation of illegal migrants in the receiving countries and finally responses to human smuggling with law enforcement strategies and prevention approaches in the countries of origin (Heckmann et al 2001; www.uni-bamberg.de/projekte/humsmug). At the end of each conference researchers took the opportunity to discuss with the participants possible next steps in research on human smuggling which need to be addressed in depth to gain more knowledge on this complex phenomenon. The results of these discussions have been incorporated in the research design of the planned project.

The European Forum for Migration Studies has participated in seminars at the Federal Office for the Recognition of Asylum Seekers in Nürnberg where the literature and documentation databases “Information Centre Asylum” and the “ASYLIS database” were presented. Within the framework of permanent exchange of information on literature and other relevant documents the efms was given direct access to the above-mentioned databases.
2.2.2 The Netherlands

Researchers at the Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies in Amsterdam have considerable past experience in interviewing asylum seekers and refugees (Doomernik 1997) and produced a number of studies on Dutch and European responses to unsolicited immigration (e.g. Doomernik/van Amersfoort/Penninx 1997; van Amersfoort/Doomernik 1998; Doomernik forthcoming). These studies share the underlying assumption that the process of globalization is complex and reaches far beyond economic integration as such. Or to put it differently: it is a process with a number of more or less well recognised direct consequences, like the increased mobility of capital, goods and information. It too allows for faster, easier and cheaper travel (see the introduction of this proposal) but only in as far as it concerns citizens of Western states this particular type of mobility is endorsed or even monopolised. An indirect consequence of globalization, however, this monopolization can never be completely successful. This is especially the case while control over who travels and enters a country by is a matter of definitions, usually in legal terms (e.g. the distinction between legal and illegal border crossing or residence). This only has the desired effect when the subjects it concerns a) are aware of these definitions, and b) conceive them a legitimate. In the case of migrants, be it on the move as the result of poverty, war or personal prosecution, or because of the mere desire to economically improve their position, it is unlikely that they are fully aware of these definitions or, if they are, feel bound by them. Other types of interventions, e.g. extensive border controls, are hard to sustain and are very likely to impede the border movements that are part of the direct consequences of globalization. In short: most Western states “produce” illegal border crossing and residence and attempts to counter these phenomena will very likely result in more smuggling activities and higher profits for smugglers.

To date few Dutch studies shed light on the modes of irregular entry into the Netherlands, be it in order to claim asylum or for other purposes. Most studies focus on the ways in which illegal immigrants sustain themselves once they have settled in the Netherlands. Nevertheless, in some instances attention is also paid to the ways in which entry was gained, and the reasons for using the means (Staring 1999 and 2001).4 This does not include persons who arrived in the Netherlands to apply for political asylum.

Official sources represent a different perspective. The Dutch Immigration and Naturalisation Service in its annual reports of the past few years puts the number of asylum seekers who arrived in the country with the aid of smugglers at around 70 percent. This figure, however, is derived from a sample in the Service's first-interview database and does in no way allow for any differentiation as to the type of assistance used or the costs involved. Yet, it seems safe to assume

4 Another, somewhat older Dutch study was already referred to in the introduction (Köser 1997).
that human smuggling has become closely interlinked with the moving of asylum seekers to and through Europe.

This conclusion supports the findings of the report written by the journalists Godfroid and Vinckx (1999) who travelled around the European periphery collecting stories from migrants attempting to get to Western Europe. Many of those intend to claim asylum once they have reached their preferred country of destination (as mentioned in the introduction of this proposal this does not mean that they are to end up in that particular country) and spend many months or even years earning enough money to procure for the services of a smuggler. It is also important that the receiving state's perspective on the smuggling business as first and foremost a criminal offence is not shared by those who require their services (see also Chin 2000 whose findings among Chinese on their way to the U.S. were very similar). This again shows law, as a particular type of definition, is probably a poor instrument against irregular immigration.

At the 6th Metropolis conference the Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies, in close collaboration with officials from the Dutch Ministry of Justice, will be hosting a workshop on human smuggling during which alternative (i.e. beyond law enforcement as such) approaches to deal with human smuggling more efficiently will be discussed. At the 5th Metropolis conference one workshop was also devoted to the subject, primarily focussed on the causes of human smuggling and the consequences it has in terms of security issues (see also http://www.international.metropolis.net).

The institute is committed on doing research on human smuggling and trafficking in migrants which can also be seen from the fact that the Dutch Ministry of Justice recently commissioned from it research proposals on what it refers to as “offered assistance in immigration to the Netherlands”.

2.2.3 Italy

In spite of the importance of the issue for an external border-country like Italy, the state of research on smuggling to and through Italy is still unsatisfactory. Very few pieces of work deal scientifically with the issue, and most of them concentrate on the policy aspects (Pastore 2000a, 2000b, 2001a, 2001b; Sciotino 2000; Balfour/Einaudi/Pastore/Rizzotti 2001). In-depth sociological enquiries into the concrete working and evolution of smuggling networks are lacking, and only a small number are based on primary sources (including case files and other judiciary materials) (Motta 2001; Scagiarini 2001). Among these the report produced by CeSPI

---

5 At the time of writing decisions are still pending.
in 2000 (Pastore/Romani/Sciortino 2000) is to be considered a pioneer study which has influenced further institutional analyses (Commissione antimafia, 2000).

The picture emerging from this work is still incomplete and extremely dynamic. Nevertheless, a few fundamental features seem rather well documented:

a) the very substantial upgrading of border controls by Italian authorities before and after the accession to the “Schengen space” (March 1998), has produced, as elsewhere in Europe and in the US, an unintended effect. Self-managed clandestine immigration has almost disappeared and the ongoing process of professionalization of smugglers has been strengthened;

b) from the organizational point of view, most smuggling rings active in and across Italy seem quite different from “traditional” criminal groups operating in the country: they are not pyramid-like organizations, based on the control of a given portion of territory and on rigid rules concerning affiliation and internal functioning. They are better described as “reticular”, net-like organizations, with a very loose relationship to local societies and highly flexible “management” strategies;

c) as a consequence, smuggling activities are extremely reactive to law enforcement decisions and to other “external” constraints (e.g. geopolitical contingencies, such as wars, embargoes, etc.) (Pastore 1998). This peculiar dynamism makes it particularly useful, if not necessary, to adopt a research approach based on continuous observation over several years, as in this project;

d) the reinforcement of the control system, also by means of increased cooperation with some crucial sending and transit countries (Albania, in the first place, but also Slovenia, Tunisia and others), produced not only “quantitative” consequences (i.e. an estimated reduction in irregular entries) but also “qualitative” ones: as in most European countries, the proportion of forced migrants and potential refugees who are compelled to make use of smuggling rings is increasing. This is clearly shown by the change in the national composition of the yearly stocks of apprehended clandestine migrants: migrants from countries like Afghanistan and Iraq are increasingly represented;

e) finally, the Italian experience shows that the interplay between smuggling and trafficking (in the meaning adopted by the UN Palermo Protocol) is limited. Most trafficking circuits seem nowadays to be based on legal entry channels (tourist visas; working visas for the show-business; etc.), preferred by criminal organizations on the basis of a careful calculation of costs and benefits. Nevertheless, also this particular aspect has been insufficiently studied
in the Italian case. Beyond a few journalistic enquiries (Kennedy-Nicotri 1999; Moroli/Sibona 1999), only a couple of studies tried and go beyond purely descriptive, qualitative approaches (Campani/Carchedi/Mottura/Picciolini 1999; Pastore/Romani/Sciortino 2000).

2.2.4 Austria

Already a quick glance through the Austrian newspapers and magazines shows that also in Austria the topic of illegal immigration receives more and more interest. Over the past few years it has become one of the major issues of the public debate on asylum and immigration. Illegality in the international context usually refers to three different aspects: the illegality of the migrants' status with respect to entry, stay and employment. Until now, the illegal crossing of the Austrian borders, including both smuggling in migrants and trafficking in human beings, has been mainly covered by the media while academic research concentrated on the illegal stay and especially on the illegal employment of migrants. In 1993 Hofer conducted qualitative interviews with illegal Polish migrants working illegally in Vienna (Hofer 1993). Last year “Social impact”, a group of social scientists, published a study on the situation of illegal cleaning women (Social Impact 2000).

With regard to trafficking in migrants and human smuggling and the irregular entry into Austria very little scientific research has been done. Besides, most existing studies – mainly academic theses and dissertations – are focussing on the legal aspects of these issues (Beiskammer 1998; Kolrus 1998). Until recently, an interdisciplinary approach to this topic which takes into consideration the socioeconomic dimensions of illegal migration has been missing. A first step to overcome this deficiency was undertaken by the European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research which in 1998 organized an international conference in Jerusalem on „Irregular migration: dynamics, impact, policy options“ (Cinar et. al 2000).

However, since Austria has been, due to its geographical location, very much affected by the growth of the trafficking in women from Central and Eastern Europe, some studies have been carried out on this topic:

a) In 1996 the IOM published an exploratory study that describes how women are trafficked, controlled and exploited in Austria. It is an analysis on how the police and the legal system respond to this new trend (IOM 1996).

b) In 1999 a study by ICMPD analyzed organized trafficking networks and their increasing links to other forms of organized crime, such as drug trafficking, money laundering and smuggling of weapons (ICMPD 1999).

c) In 1999 and 2000 another very important research project was carried out by the Ludwig
Boltzmann Institute for Human Rights in Austria. From a human rights perspective and in the context of violence against women, the study investigates the methods of combatting trafficking in women on both an international as well as on a national level. On the national level the research analyzes the actual extend of the problem and focuses on relevant legal practice compared to other European and international strategies (Kartusch et al 2000).

d) In 2001 the study “Applied Research and Data Collection on Trafficking in Women and Children for Sexual Exploitation to, through and from the Balkan region” focussed on Austria as receiving country has been carried out in context of an IOM programme (Kugler 2001).

The International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), an inter-governemental organization with headquarters in Vienna was created in 1993. The purpose of the Centre is to promote comprehensive and sustainable migration policies and to function as a service exchange mechanism for governments and organizations on mainly European migration issues. In this context ICMPD has also been elaborating several studies on long-term strategies for managing migration in general, and specific issues such as comparative analyses on asylum and immigration policies, policies and practices of temporary protection, irregular migration and trafficking. In 1998 the Austrian Forum for Migration Studies (AFM) has been created within ICMPD, a special unit to coordinate and carry out research projects in the field of migration.6

Over the last decade smuggling in migrants and trafficking in human beings have come to be a major public concern in all EU Member States. Already in 1994 Jonas Widgren, the director of ICMPD, presented a paper on the “Multilateral co-operation to combat trafficking in migrants and the role of international organizations” at the Eleventh IOM Seminar in Geneva (Widgren 1994). In 1999 ICMPD prepared a study on the “Relationship between organized crime and trafficking in aliens” (ICMPD 1999).

In 1999 ICMPD has established, with the support of the Hungarian government, a diplomatic mission in Budapest. Since its inception the office has set up an electronic library of text and statistical data, submitted by over a dozen border enforcement agencies in the Region as well as in a transatlantic context. This data base of both open and confidential information forms the heart of the “Counter Trafficking Information Programme” (CTIP), which provides analysts and academics with a wealth of timely data on illegal migration not only from the Region, but also from countries of origin. A report on “Illegal migration and trafficking. Central and Eastern

6 For example “A comparative analysis of entry and asylum policies in selected western countries”, “Levels of qualification of Slovene, Czech and Hungarian migrants and their position on the Austrian labour market” and “Admission of Third Country Nationals to the Member States of the European Union for the purposes of study or vocational training and admission of persons not gainfully employed”.

-15-
Europe” is published on an annual basis.

When in the framework of the “Stability Pact” a “Task force” dedicated to the combat of Trafficking in Human has been created, has assumed the responsibility for one area of concern, namely training and exchange programmes. Together with the SECI Regional Center for Combatting Trans-Border Crime as well as the International Migration Policy Programme (IMP) and in collaboration with the International Organization for Migration (IOM), ICMPD has developed a “Comprehensive Programme for training, exchange and co-operation to Address Trafficking in Human Beings in South Eastern Europe”. The programme is included in the Anti-Trafficking Action Plan that was endorsed by the Trafficking Task Force at its recent meeting in Vienna.

Since 1993 ICMPD has also served as the Secretariat of the „Budapest Group”, the only pan-European forum bringing together Senior Officials of Ministries of Interior and Justice dealing with migration issues from more than 40 governments and some 10 international organizations. The process aims at preventing irregular migration and trafficking in human beings and at establishing sustainable systems for orderly migration in the wider European region. Amongst others, the process supports the harmonization of anti-trafficking legislation among all Budapest Group participating countries, as well information exchange and technical assistance, and visa and return/readmission policies. In the framework of the Budapest process, a „Working Group on South-East Europe” (comprising some 20 Governments and relevant international organizations) was established in 1998. Work in this group has i.e. comprised assessment missions to land, air and sea borders in the region, the promotion of the new border service in Bosnia and Herzegovina and fight against trafficking in human beings through Albania to Italy etc.

Furthermore ICMPD serves as Secretariat for the “International Border Police Conference”, in short the Siófok process, which regularly gathers the heads of border guard and border police authorities of 35 countries from all over Europe. At the 9th Conference, held only very recently, the border guards have agreed to exchange information on irregular migration through the ICMPD Liaison office in Budapest,. The system is in place and an increasing number of border guard authorities contribute regularly to the system, as they recognize the usefulness of the analysis and compilation that they receive in return.
2.2.5 Switzerland

As in many other countries human smuggling and trafficking in migrants became an issue of wider interest in Switzerland only during the last decade. So far no large-scale empirical research has been undertaken on this subject. However, some aspects have been raised in projects on related topics such as sexual exploitation and prostitution of migrant women (Schmitz 1991) or in official reports (Bundesamt für Polizei 1999).

In collaboration with migrant associations or NGOs several publications analyze the phenomenon of trafficking in women (Frauenhandel) on the basis of in-depth interviews with women concerned. In general these studies focus on the legal and social situation of trafficked women in Switzerland, but also enter the discussion about the migration process and trafficking operations. Strategies include recruitment of marriage and labour candidates (sex industry and sometimes domestic work). In some cases the authors consider it difficult to draw a line between regular and irregular activities as well as between coercion and voluntary migration (Schmid / Le Breton Baumgartner 1998; Karrer et al. 1996; Spring 1992). Caroni (1996) gives an overview over regulations and the legal situation of migrant artists and marriage “applicants”.

Limited but interesting insight into irregular migration processes and the role of smugglers is provided by the research project of the Swiss Forum for Migration Studies about asylum destinations. The principal research question investigated by the 176 interviews in Switzerland and 67 interviews in countries of origin was to understand why and how asylum seekers happen to choose a particular country. It appeared that particularly in cases of long distance migration and limited financial resources smugglers - together with family members abroad - played a crucial role in the choice of destination. As many of the interviewees only had little information about the migration arrangements, this aspect couldn't be analyzed in detail. However, many statements showed that the relationship between the migrant and the “agent” or smuggler considerably varies between migration patterns. The interviews also rose numerous questions about the determinants of the decisions made by smugglers or traffickers and the degree of concordance between their interests and those of the migrants concerned.

A creative approach to this complex phenomenon has been chosen in the film “Reise der Hoffnung” by Xavier Koller, inspired by the death of a Kurdish refugee child trying to reach Swiss territory in winter 1988. Though similar cases had been reported previously this death aroused particular indignation in the public because the child himself couldn't be held responsible

---

The Swiss partner will not be part of the European Collaborative Research Project in Social Sciences. The Swiss National Science Foundation has invited the Swiss Forum for Migration Studies to submit the project at an administrative unity of the Confederation. Prof. Dr. Cattacin will initiate negotiations with the Swiss Federal Office for Refugees.
for his misfortune and because smugglers were involved. In a book on the film a typology of smugglers is proposed ranging from “occasional smugglers” (or “Fluchthelfer”) with rather humanitarian motivations to professional “smuggler gangs” as often described in the media (Sieg 1990). More recently the experience of irregular immigration to Switzerland was described by a former professor of political science in Geneva who undertook himself an illegal journey from Tunisia transiting through Italy (Mellah 2000).

2.2.6 Spain

In Spain, because of its geographical position as one of the external border countries of the European Union, there is great concern on this issue. It is a constant topic in the media and also on the political arena. The recent law on immigration gives enormous weight to the pursuit of all activities related to human smuggling and trafficking, favouring those who denounce any such activities with the possibility of remaining legally in the country.

In spite of this almost no research has been carried out on this topic. The only studies, both as yet unconcluded, deal specifically with trafficking in women for the purpose of prostitution. The first of these studies is being carried out by a group connected to the non-governmental organization ACSUR-LAS SEGOVIAS. It is qualitative in nature and only includes women of two nationalities (Ecuadorians and Colombians) as well as being locally based in Madrid and La Coruña. The other research is of a legal nature and is investigating the jurisprudence on smuggling networks related to female prostitution. This research is also based in an NGO: the Federation for Family Planning.

No universities or research institutes, as can be seen, have as yet taken direct interest in this matter probably due to the difficulties inherent to it. Indirectly the subject has been touched upon in the also scarce researches on irregular migration. The Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones (IEM) has participated in the most encompassing research on irregular migrants which has been carried out in Spain. The research was coordinated by the University of Deusto and has been published under the title “Los inmigrantes irregulares en España” (Ruiz de Olabuénaga et al. 1999). The different forms and causes of irregularity amongst which are being smuggled into the country are considered. And also the tragic situation of irregular migrants who have been prey to smuggling networks appears in all its crudeness when exploring the social situation and way of life of irregular migrants.

The reason for the irregularity as well as the characteristics of irregular migrants are also the concern of A. Izquierdo (University of La Coruña) who is at present carrying out his research, using quantitative methods, with immigrants who applied for their “papers” in the recent
regularization process which has taken place in Spain (February to June 2000). On the legal side the issue of irregularity and the conditions for regularization in Spain has been looked into by the IEM (Cristina Gortázar 2000).

Apart from this the IEM recently (February 2001) participated in a research seminar organized by the Instituto Duque de Ahumada of the Guarda Civil on “Immigration and Security” where questions related to both issues of irregularity and of smuggling and trafficking in migrants were central.

3 Research goals and work plan

3.1 Research goals

The project will focus on the following interconnected research questions which are derived from the gaps in the research literature:

Identifying types of human smuggling organizations
The stereotypical image of the organization of smuggling is that of internationally operating pyramid-like structures that make billions of dollars of profit. The project intends to challenge this stereotype and is interested in the sociology of organization of the smuggling process. Research is needed on the complex forms and degrees of smuggling organizations, possibly ranging from pyramid structure to loose, flexible networks or “Mom and Pop” (Kyle / Liang 1998) smuggling or other forms. The research should make it possible to develop typologies and explanations of different types of smuggling operations. Systematic typologies on smuggling organizations will reduce some of the ambiguities seen in the current literature on smuggling regarding theories explaining the origins and dynamics of human smuggling. This is particularly relevant because an extremely varied range of people are involved in discussions about ways to combat smuggling (scientists from different disciplines, authorities, international organizations, NGOs). Such research will also help governments to make priorities as to which types of smuggling operations to target for law enforcement and preventive strategies.

The role of human smugglers in the migration process
Document analyses, expert interviews and interviews with smuggled persons will provide insight into the modes of operandi of smugglers and the role of human smugglers in the migration process; the points during the migration process at which their 'services' are required and the reasons why; the types of these 'services'; the sums paid for them; the extent to which they determine the destination country. General conclusions could be deducted form the example of asylum seekers currently coming to Europe.
Explaining the dynamics of smuggling operations from a sociological perspective

Analyzing the interplay between illegal migration (predominantly supported by smuggling organizations) and legal admission schemes one can state a growing awareness (also at the official level) of that. If it is undisputed that the increase in illegal flows during the 80s and 90s was partly caused by the gradual closure of legal channels, it is also likely that a proactive (although obviously selective) admission policy would disincentive the use of smugglers. Such assumption is explicitly inspiring some national policies (e.g. the Italian system entails “privileged” admission quotas for national of selected countries - at present Albania, Morocco and Tunisia - on the basis of bilateral agreements aimed at fostering a cooperative approach to migration control) and it seems to influence the European Commission's approach as expressed in the Communication on a common European immigration policy (November 2000, COM (2000) 757). This relation has to be looked into in the planned project.

In the scientific and public discourse various simplistic models are frequently used to explain and illustrate the dynamics underlying human smuggling and trafficking processes. One, for example, is the “model of interconnecting pipes” which assumes a fixed migration flow and states that if there are fewer opportunities for legal migration into a specific country, one can expect more migration through illegal channels (Müller-Schneider 2000a, 2000b). An alternative model discussed in the relevant literature explains the volume of illegal migration from the degree of social organization of the smuggling process. It describes central stages in the smuggling process: the decision-making process by the migrants themselves and their contacts to smugglers, the trip through transit countries including crossing the border to the country of destination, and the their situation after the arrival (forms of “modern slavery”, the social situation etc.). These findings will be discussed in the project. A summary presented in the project might vary according to the types of smuggling examined. It should also include aspects like the professionalization of smugglers and unintended consequences of counter strategies.

Development of comparative perspectives

All the research goals described above will be investigated from a comparative perspective which will make it possible to identify country-specific phenomena as well as similarities and overlaps; all the project partners are transit or receiving countries in the smuggling and trafficking process, although they differ considerably in their geographical characteristics and also have different asylum and immigration policies. This allows for a great number of valuable comparisons; some variables might already be assumed to be of considerable importance:

a) being party of the Schengen agreement or not (Switzerland);
b) having open or spurious borders to neighbouring countries (all Schengen member states and Switzerland) or not;
c) maintaining an outside Schengen land border (Germany, Austria, Italy, Spain) or not (the
Netherlands).

**Building a transnational expert network**

Smuggling operations generally involve a range of countries, including countries of origin, transit and destination. Collaborative multilateral research is an essential approach to analyze and tackle these issues. One of the project's goals is to pool national know-how and build up a transnational research infrastructure. The project partners will be national focal points coordinating the research activities.

The planned project will apply and test an innovative research approach by combining the analyses of official statistical data and documents with qualitative studies. National research expertise will be pooled in the respective countries. Furthermore, it will be exchanged and discussed with other national institutions as well as with experts in the partner countries.

The qualification and previous work of the researchers working on the project in the respective countries will provide for an interdisciplinary approach to the topic, contributing analyses from a sociological, legal, geographical or policy-oriented perspective.

### 3.2 Research design and applied methodology

To get a better description and explanation of types, origins and dynamics of human smuggling and trafficking in migrants, a very covert phenomena, the project will entail three compatible research approaches: document analysis and expert interviews as well as narrative, biographical interviews with smuggled persons. This will make it possible to get an overall picture of the entire smuggling process and its causes and dynamics. The information gained from these empirical approaches will enter a process of continual dialogue of theory formation, in which the development of the theory alternates with the continual inspection of the data material (Kleining 1995, 250). By doing this the specific characteristics of this extensive phenomenon can be comprehensively examined and can be structured from a theoretical perspective. At the end of this continual dialogue is the “theoretical saturation” (Kleining 1995, 267).
3.2.1 Document analysis and expert interviews

3.2.1.1 Data sources

In preparation of this project proposal the efms has identified and contacted potential sources of information on human smuggling and trafficking in Germany and has made sure that access to these sources will be available for empirical research. To reach the research goals stated above an analysis of the following official documents will be carried out:

a) **Documents of the “Information Centre Asylum” and the “ASYLIS database” of the Federal Office for the Recognition of Asylum Seekers**

The database includes detailed information in the following fields:

- Reports of liaison staff in the countries of origin, analyses of interviews with smuggled persons (providing information on smuggling routes, meeting points, structures of smuggling organizations), facts and information on the countries of origin, articles, press releases (ASYLIS press database), relevant law texts (ASYLIS law database), publications (ASYLIS literature database and detailed and regularly updated country reports. Within the framework of permanent exchange of information on literature and other relevant documents the efms was given direct access to the above-mentioned databases.

b) **Case files**, collected by the court in Cham, Bavaria (close to the German-Czech border) documenting smuggling cases from 1997-2000. The files document court proceedings on smuggling cases at the German-Czech border, including information on motives, smuggling routes, the financial aspects of the smuggling process and the structure of smuggling organizations.

c) Data from the **German Federal Border Police database** on smuggling operations, including information on smuggling routes, the social structure of smuggling organizations, nationalities of smugglers as well as smuggled persons and links to organized crime. The research time visited the Federal Border Police headquarters in Koblenz where the smuggling file was presented and access to the governmental data guaranteed.

d) Data from **local police authorities** who are dealing with the national and domestic problems incurred with human smuggling and trafficking in migrants, such as accommodation, labour or prostitution (contacts to the criminal police in Nuremberg are existing). Data from the joint smuggling investigation groups ("gemeinsame Schleuserermittlungsgruppe") of the Länder and the Federal Border Police.
These analyses will be supplemented by interviews with selected experts, especially border police officials, officials at the Federal Office for the Recognition of Asylum Seekers and experts from NGOs supporting illegal migrants in the receiving country (e.g. Caritas).

For the Netherlands a similar survey of existing databases has been prepared. The Ministry of Justice maintains a database in which accounts of the routes taken by all asylum seekers are registered. Access to this source poses few restrictions but the data it contains can only be analyzed with considerable caution as it is known that smugglers also provide their clients with the “proper” story to tell the authorities. In addition, interviews are to be conducted with a number of Dutch experts, among others from the Military Police (responsible for border controls), the Human Smuggling Information Group of the Justice Ministry and the special national police squad for combatting smuggling.

In the case of Italy research will be based on the following sets of sources:

a) **official** documents (parliamentary enquiries; governmental reports such as the yearly report of the Minister of the Interior to the Parliament on the implementation of 1998 Aliens and Immigration Act);

b) data from the **Italian Ministry of Interior databases** on apprehended illegal migrants and on persons arrested/denounced for the crime of illegal smuggling;

c) **case files collected by selected Prosecutor's offices** in the areas most affected by smuggling operations. A network of contacts and a specific expertise in dealing with such peculiar and sensitive source was developed by CeSPI on the occasion of a previous research on the same subject (Pastore/ Romani/ Sciortino 2000; see also chapter 1: applicants' research expertise relevant to the project).

As for other target countries also in the Italian case these written sources will be supplemented by interviews with selected experts, especially judges, prosecutors, police officials, members of the National Commission for the Recognition of Asylum Seekers and NGOs personnel.

In Austria the following data sources are available:

a) Documents such as **recent country reports** on trafficking in women;

b) Annual Report “Organisierte Schlepperkriminalität” prepared by the Federal Police (“Bundespolizeidirektion”);
c) **Court records and databases**

d) Official information on trafficking gathered by the Police (only regional – “Gendarmerieprotokolle”);

e) Data from the **Austrian Ministry of Interior** databases on apprehended illegal migrants, traffickers, smugglers;

f) Statistics from Austrian military detachments controlling the Eastern Austrian borders.

The Austrian partner will carry out expert interviews with officials at the Ministry of Interior: Federal Police (Bundespolizeidirektion), the Federal Border Police, regional police departments for crime (kriminalpolizeiliche Abteilungen der Länder) as well as representatives of the military, and experts from NGOs supporting illegal migrants and trafficked women in Austria (e.g. Caritas, LEFÖ, EFD).

As a complementary approach to the one proposed by Germany, The Netherlands and Austria, interviews with key persons of refugee support or other charitable associations and migrant organizations would be carried out in **Switzerland**. Experiences of former studies proved that leaders of support organizations often have interesting first hand information about the process of illegal or semi-legal immigration. Though it is not easy to convince such experts to collaborate, many of them support research if given guarantees of confidentiality and neutrality in the planned analysis.

Interviews with “official” experts and key persons at the Swiss Federal Office for Refugees and the Border Police are also planned. The aim is, on the one hand, to get direct information about migration processes and routes of illegal immigration. On the other hand, officials might provide further indications about written sources (court records, case files, police protocols, etc.) containing useful information.

For **Spain** several potential sources for data have also been identified and contacted. Following that the research will be initially based on the following sets of documents and databases:

a) Official reports of the **Central Police Unit for Foreigners and of the different police bodies** (National Police, Civil Guard);

b) Data from the **Government Delegation for Immigration**;

c) Databases of the **General Police Office of the Ministry of the Interior** on apprehended illegal migrants and on persons/networks denounced or arrested for illegal smuggling and trafficking in migrants;
d) Reports by the NGOs, trade unions and others on human smuggling and trafficking in migrants.

New sources of documents which come to light during the research will also be included. Spain will, as other countries, supplement the research design with interviews with selected experts as well as government and police officials from the different police bodies with competence in these matters and with experts from NGOs and trade unions whose work puts them in touch with irregular migrants.

3.2.1.2 Analysis of data collected by expert interviews and document analysis: procedure and methodology

One very important research method in social sciences are interviews with selected experts. “Experts” are persons with specialist knowledge or special insights due to their role as participants in certain processes. Experts are objective and are able to distance themselves to the subject in question, in contrast to affected persons who can only convey their very personal and subjective perspective of a process or situation.

In the planned project experts from different institutions concerned with human smuggling and trafficking in migrants from various perspectives will be interviewed on subjects relevant for the research questions. By doing this “multi-perspective cross-examination” researchers get a wide range of specialist information regarding the overall smuggling process and can check its validity. The interview itself is a relatively open communicative process: researcher and experts will explore analytically the subject in question, abstracting relevant facts and information from the personal significance and subjective dimensions. To ensure complete coverage of relevant aspects the researchers will prepare a checklist based on the main theoretical dimensions elaborated in the framework. Thus, the results of the expert interviews can be analyzed systematically by content analysis; this will also provide systematic categories which can be utilized for the analysis of documents.

The project partners will decide on the empirical method to analyze the collected data at their first project meeting. There should be a harmonized approach to make results comparable and to allow comparisons between the variables mentioned in the following section (3.2.2). One possibility for a systematic analysis of documents and files could be systematic content analysis. For this approach the following consecutive steps are required:

a) selection of data material which includes as many perspectives as possible and are empirically productive;
b) using discourse-analytical interpretation methods when coding the texts;
c) construction of multi-dimensional and relational category-systems.

This analytical instrument allows for multi-dimensional aspects analysis as well as illustration of relations between individual dimensions.

### 3.2.2 Qualitative, biographical in-depth interviews with smuggled persons: procedure and methodology

The overall research design will include the analysis of secondary data described above as well as the collection of primary data. The goal of this empirical approach is to gain knowledge on the following aspects:

- **a)** the decision making process of the smuggled person, the motivation and biographical aspects of this decision;
- **b)** how the smuggled person obtained the necessary contacts for the smuggling operation;
- **c)** experiences in the smuggling process;
- **d)** the presence of relatively old and established immigrant communities including chain migration from the countries of origin (all countries except Italy and Spain - which has only relatively recently become countries of immigration);
- **e)** characteristics of the reception and asylum seekers;
- **f)** size and character of the informal economy.

Asylum seekers are a group of migrants among whom large numbers of individuals can be found who have first hand knowledge of the smuggling phenomenon. In comparison to persons apprehended and registered in the official databases, these people have “successfully” reached the destination country. Apprehended persons might be biassed in an interview with officials providing very restricted information, for example, on the smuggling route to avoid being sent back to one of the transit countries. To get a complete picture from both perspectives it is therefore necessary to carry out qualitative interviews with the smuggled persons themselves.

By means of a research method common to social anthropology and related social sciences – biographical interviews – we propose to approach recently arrived asylum seekers who are still housed in hostels and recognized asylum seekers. The researchers intend to pay each individual to be interviewed two visits, with an interval of some weeks. There are at least three good reasons for using this method. First of all, background information on an individuals life may shed considerable light on the motives of a person to migrate and thus give us some ideas on where preventive measures should be in place. Secondly, this method greatly helps to build trust
or rapport between interviewer and interviewee. Thirdly, if the interviewee would get the notion that he or she is only interviewed because we need to know about his experiences with smugglers, it becomes considerably less likely that trustworthy details are provided.

As to the feasibility of this approach it should be mentioned that Chin (2000) managed to interview no less than 300 Chinese immigrants who were smuggled into the United States. Even though these were quite formal interviews these yielded unique and highly valuable information on the modes of travel, the identity of the smugglers and their way of recruiting clients. Less formal, narrative interviewing techniques, as they are to be employed as part of this project, were extensively used in a study among refugees from the former Soviet Union by Doomernik (1997) and also proved to be a very useful instrument for sensitive and personal details. The same can be said about the survey conducted by Koser (1997) among asylum seekers from Iran and a study by Wong and Pfahler on recognized asylum seekers from Eritrea, Iran and Afghanistan in Nuremberg (Wong et al 1993).

The project partners propose to interview smuggled persons from three countries of origin, each making up sizable categories of asylum seekers in the destination countries. Based on 1999 and 2000 statistics and ensuring geographical diversity, the four to five following countries might be possible choices: Afghanistan, Iraq, Somalia, Turkey and the former Republic of Yugoslavia. With the latter country of origin one would have to start off with looking in some detail at the ethnic composition of the asylum seeker population as official migration statistics do not provide for any such distinction. Besides Afghanistan and the former Republic of Yugoslavia Austria registered a high number of asylum applications from Somalia as well as considerable numbers from India, Iran, Iraq, Nigeria, Sierra Leone and Sudan. The Swiss partner proposes in-depth interviews with asylum seekers or recognized refugees\(^8\) which will be discussed at the first project meeting. As former surveys of the Swiss Forum for Migration Studies show the confidence building period is essential and the involvement of key persons from charitable or migrant associations (see expert interviews) proves to be very helpful in establishing trust inspiring contacts. A major difficulty to be expected, is the fact that many of the migrants having passed through an intercontinental route, organized by “agencies” will not be able to provide many details of the decisions made about their itineraries and destinations. As interviews in Switzerland demonstrated, many of them don’t negotiate with the smugglers themselves and play quite a passive role during the migration process.

---

\(^8\)Refugees with a stable status feel more secure providing sensitive information, but as the duration of the asylum procedure is usually quite long, it is difficult to find status refugees who arrived less than one year ago.
For each country of origin 15 individuals should at length\(^9\) be interviewed twice. Interviewers will be employed who are bilingual or native speakers. These may be young university graduates who originate from the immigrant communities concerned or relevantly qualified previous asylum seekers who have been granted a residence permit. During the first interview trust is built up and a first account of the individuals life and its decisive moments is noted. A second interview serves to fill any holes in the first account of an interviewee's biography and his description of the smuggling experience. This is also the occasion where it can be expected that the asylum seeker will provide the most trustworthy account of his or her experiences during the actual migration process. We do not intend to use a recording devise as experience has taught us that this unnecessarily formalises the conversation, paper and pencil will be used instead. Important demographic aspects (sex, age, nationality) of the interviewed person will be included in the interview record.

In the case of Spain biographical in-depth interviews with asylum seekers would hardly make sense as the overall numbers of this category are insignificant compared to other European countries. This also applies to the numbers in any nationality. For this reason the in-depth interviews will be envisaged with irregular migrants in Spain who have successfully been smuggled into the country. Apart from this different countries of origin of the irregular immigrants will have to be contemplated as the ones initially suggested are also significant in number for Spain. Although, as it has been said, the relevant nationalities for each country will be decided at the first project meeting, the initial choice would possibly fall on Moroccans, Ecuadorians, Colombians and Ukrainians. The reason for choosing these nationalities would be, in the first three cases, statistical significance (these are the most numerous present in Spain, also with the largest numbers of irregular migrants) as well as greater diversity in patterns of illegal entry into the country, according to indications from previous researchers, Ukrainians on the other hand, are not such a large community, but studying them would probably show other differences in routes as well as in types of smuggling and trafficking networks involved.

It has to be emphasized that the nationalities of potential interviewees depends on the current situation and recent developments in the countries of origin and destination. As smuggling routes as well as destination countries might change, the project partners will chose relevant nationalities for the respective countries at their first project meeting, based on current statistics, interviews with NGOs and social workers and subject to the research partners' previous experience in relevant projects.

\(^9\) As a rule we expect these conversations to have an average duration of 4 hours.
4.3 Work plan for the project partners: work packages and joint activities

Within the framework of the new European Collaborative Research Project in the Social Sciences national research projects will be coordinated. This means that each national project is autonomous with regard to budget, research design and work plan. The tasks and work packages will focus on the respective national level, including joint activities of the project partners.

The overall term of the research project will be 36 months.

The researchers in charge of the project in each country will be in a continuous communication process, exchanging preliminary research results and keeping each other informed on the progress of the project. For a systematic, in-depth discussion after every important stage in the project design the research partners will meet regularly. The first project meeting will take place after three months and will be organized by the Dutch and German project partner; at that meeting further forms of cooperation and the respective country's involvement will be decided on by the project team.

The project partners consider the dissemination of research results a very important aspect of the project. The following strategies will be applied:

a) Writing of final reports (on the national levels as well as a joint final report)

b) Publication of articles in relevant magazines

c) Presentation of the research findings in the press and other media

d) Setting up of a project website;

e) Organization of a final conference where the research results will be presented to experts from academia, border police officials etc. (subject to the partners' suggestions).

The work packages are derived from the research design described above:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Work packages</strong></th>
<th><strong>Duration</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Literature analysis; analysis of national legal situation  
Organizational preparation of data collection | 3 months |
| **First project meeting of all partners** (organized by German and Dutch partners in Germany or The Netherlands) | |
| Secondary data analysis:  
Expert interviews  
Document analysis | 12 months |
| **Second project meeting of all partners** | |
| Primary data collection and analysis  
(biographical qualitative interviews) | 12 months |
| **Third project meeting of all partners** | |
| Writing final report (national reports and joint research report of all partners) | 6 months |
| Organization of final conference of project partners and European experts on human smuggling and trafficking in migrants  
Dissemination of research results | 3 months |
| **Final conference** | |
References

ACSUR - Las Segovias (1999):
Contra el tráfico de mujeres, Madrid: Asociación para la Cooperación con el Sur, ACSUR - Las Segovias.

Alt, J. (1999):
Illegal in Deutschland. Forschungsprojekt zur Lebenssituation”illegaler” Migranten in Leipzig, Karlsruhe: Loeper Literaturverlag im Ariadne Buchdienst.


Das Schleppereidelikt nach § 104a StGB im Vergleich zu den Schleppereidelikten nach §§ 104,105 FrG, Diplomarbeit, Salzburg: Universität Salzburg.

Trafficking in women: after the ‘95s world conference on women: women's policy perspectives, Wien: Bundesministerium für Frauenangelegenheiten und Verbraucherschutz.

Asylum migration to the European Union, patterns of origin and destination, Luxembourg: Office for official publications of the European Communities.

Bundesamt für Polizei (1999):

Campani G./ Carchedi F./ Mottura G./ Picciolini A. (Eds.) (1999):

Tänzerinnen und Heiratsmigrantinnen - rechtliche Aspekte des Frauenhandels in der Schweiz, Luzern: Caritas-Verlag.

-31-
Chin, Ko-Lin (2000):


Commissione antimafia (2000):

In Deutschland arbeiten und in Polen leben. Was die neuen WanderarbeiterInnen aus Polen bewegt, in: Infodienst Migration 1, März 1995 (Diakonisches Werk der EKD).


Doomernik, J. (1997):

Doomernik, J. (2000):
Doomernik, J. (forthcoming):
Van daar naar hier. Van werving tot mensensmokkel. Contribution commissioned by Tijschrift voor Criminologie.

Eichenhofer, E. (Hrsg.)(1999):
Migration und Illegalität, Osnabrück.


Mensensmokkel. Amsterdam: Meulenhoff.


Höbling, L. (1996):

Hofer, K. (1993):
Arbeitsstrich. Unter polnischen Schwarzarbeitern, Wien.

Hoffmann-Nowotny, H.-J. (1993):

ICMPD (Ed.) (1999):
The Relationship between Organized Crime and Trafficking in Aliens, Study prepared by the Secretariat of the Budapest Group, June 1999, Wien: ICMPD.

ICMPD (Ed.) (2001):

International Organization for Migration (IOM) (1996):
Trafficking in Women to Austria for Sexual Exploitation, Migration Information Programme, Helsinki: IOM, June 1996.

 Trafficking In Migrants, Quarterly Bulletin, No 21.

Entschieden im Abseits - Frauen in der Migration, Zürich: Limmat Verlag.


Lucciole nere. Le prostitute nigeriane si raccontano, Milano: Kaos.

Lehrbuch Entdeckende Sozialforschung, Weinheim.
Der Menschenhandel - ein Strafrechtsvergleich zwischen Österreich und Deutschland. Diplomarbeit, Graz: Karl-Franz-Universität.


Kugler, I. (2001):  

Migration Merchants: Organized Migrant Trafficking from China to Ecuador, Davis.


LEFÖ (Lateinamerikanische Emigrierte Frauen in Österreich) (1998):  
Nein zum Frauenhandel, Wien: LEFÖ

§217 StGB, Dissertation, Innsbruck: Leopold-Franzens-Universität.

Martin, P. / Miller, M. (2000):  

Mellah, F. (2000):  

Schiave d'occidente. Sulle rotte dei mercanti di donne, Milano: Mursia.
Morrison, J. (2000):
The trafficking and smuggling of refugees – the end game in European asylum policy?,
Geneva: UNHCR.

Immigrazione clandestinità e criminalità. Puglia frontiera d'Europa, in: Becucci, S.,
Massari, M. (eds.), Mafie nostre, mafie loro. Criminalità organizzata italiana e straniera
nel Centro-Nord, Torino: Edizioni di Comunità.

Müller-Schneider, T. (2000a):
Explaining Human Smuggling. A Sociological Approach. Paper submitted to the

Müller-Schneider, T. (2000b):
Zuwanderung in westliche Gesellschaften. Analyse und Steuerungsoptionen, Opladen.

Pastore, F. (1998):
Conflicts and Migrations. A Case Study on Albania, written briefing addressed to the
Conflict Prevention Network of the European Commission, January 1998 – and CeSPI
Occasional Papers, March 1998

Pastore, F. (2000a):
e la politica internazionale, Bologna: Il Mulino for IAI-ISPI.

Pastore, F. (2000b):
Italy Facing International Migration: Recent Policy Developments, in: The International

Pastore, F. (2001a):
La politica dell'immigrazione, in: Bruni, F./Ronzitti, N. (eds.), L'italia e la politica

Pastore, F. (2001b):
L'Italia e le migrazioni dall'est, in: Balfour, R. (ed.), Guida ai paesi dell' Europa centrale
orientale e balcanica. Annuario politico-economico 2001, Bologna: Il Mulino,
forthcoming.

Renner, G. (1999):

Riedel, V. (2000):
Measures Undertaken to Combat the Employment of Foreigners in an irregular Situation in Austria, in: OECD, Combating the Illega employment of Foreign Workers, Paris: OECD, pp.139-142.

Irregulares en España, Bilbao: Universidad de Deusto.

Salt, J. (2000a):
Note from the Guest Editor, in: International Migration, Vol. 38.

Salt, J. (2000b):
Migrant Trafficking and Human Smuggling in Europe. A Review of the Evidence with Case Studies from Hungary, Poland and Ukraine, IOM.

Salt, J. / Hogarth, J. (2000b)
Migrant Trafficking and Human Smuggling in Europe. Geneva: IOM.


Scagliarini, L. (2001):

Migration von Frauen aus Mittel- und Osteuropa in die Schweiz, Zürich: Fraueninformationszentrum FIZ.


Sieg, C. (Hrsg.) (1990):  
Reise der Hoffnung - Flucht, Schleppertum und schweizerische Asylpolitik. Ein Dokumentarband zum Thema des Film von Xavier Koller, Zürich: Werd Verlag.

Sieveking, K. (1999):  

Social Impact (Hg.) (2000):  

Spring, K. (1992):  
Gekauftes Unglück - Frauenhandel in der Schweiz, Caritas - FIZ - SKF, Luzern: Caritas-Verlag.

Staring, R. (1999):  

Staring, R. (2001):  

United Nations General Assembly (2000):  

Menschenhandel, §217 StGB, Diplomarbeit, Graz: Karl-Franzens-Universität.

Vom Exil zur Diaspora: Asyl in einer deutschen Stadt. Forschungsbericht, Nürnberg.